[Mr. K. C. Mammen Mappillai.]

cottages where this industry is to be carried out and then purchasing them from these people and selling them as finished products. These may be sold at wholesale rates and the sale proceeds may be redistributed so that the money may reach the producers without a considerable portion of it being consumed by middlemen. Simply to say that cottage industries must be encouraged is not enough. There must be conditions favourable for the sale. The supply of raw materials must be made at cheap rates. Another thing is securing the best possible prices and finding the best markets for the finished goods. These are the conditions that will alone enable the cottage industry to thrive satisfactorily. In order that this end may be attained, I want to suggest to the Director as well as to the Government that a chosen industry must be taken up and introduced in one of the villages where conditions may be favourable and facilities which I have already mentioned should be secured for that village. If this is found successful in that particular village, it may accordingly be introduced in other villages. With that object, I moved the motion. Now that I have had my say, I withdraw the motion.

PRESIDENT: May I take it that the House permits the motion to be withdrawn?

The motion was, by leave, withdrawn.

Motion 251.

The following motion was not moved:—

MR. N. KUMARAN:

251. To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1·40 lakhs under Demand XIV by Rs. 100.

PRESIDENT: I will now put to the vote of the House whether it sanctions the amount of Rs. 1·40 lakhs on account of Demand XIV—Industries.

The demand was carried.

MR. CHANGANACHERY K. PARAMESVARAN PILLAI (*Quilon*): There are 25 minutes more.

PRESIDENT: Does the House like to continue the sitting.

MR. V. SUBBA AIYAR (*Nominated*) (*Deputy President*): It is better that we go on.

DEMAND XV—MEDICAL DEPARTMENT.

PRESIDENT: We now come to the Medical Department.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Durbar Physician's duties*): Sir, I beg to move for a grant not exceeding Rs. 5·53 lakhs under Demand XV—Medical Department.

May I come to the front, Sir?

PRESIDENT: Yes. Do come to the front.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

Motion 252.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): Sir, I beg to move the following motion :—

252. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 2,000 for travelling allowance by Rs. 10.

The object of my motion, Sir, is to bring to the notice of Government the negligence of the present officer in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties in supervising the work of the various hospitals in the State. If my information is correct, the present officer who is in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties has not submitted her tour notes to Government as was hitherto done by the permanent Darbar Physician, detailing the work of the various Hospitals.

PRESIDENT: May I ask Mr. Nilakanta Pillai where he got his information from?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): I said 'if my information is correct.'

PRESIDENT: That presumes that you have some information.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): I have some information. I cannot get any definite information.

PRESIDENT: Will you just listen to me for a moment? Any communication between an officer and Government is considered confidential and a tour note of an officer which is submitted to Government is confidential. Consequently nobody outside official circles could have knowledge of it.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): After hearing the officer in charge of the department, I may withdraw the motion.

PRESIDENT: But do you base it on any definite information?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): I have no definite information.

PRESIDENT: Then upon what do you base your statement?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): We have to give some opinion about the working of the department. Even though we do not directly refer to the officer in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties, we make enquiries in the mofussil hospitals whether the Darbar Physician visited the place.

PRESIDENT: Then you might have phrased your statement more happily.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*): Sir, may I know how medical officers in the mofussil hospitals can have knowledge of the reports sent by the Darbar Physician to Government?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): At least they can presume, if the Darbar Physician has not visited that institution.

PRESIDENT: But your statement was on tour notes.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): I qualified my statement by saying 'if my information is correct'.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

PRESIDENT : Your statement was that the present officer in charge of the duties of the Darbar Physician's office has not submitted her tour diaries to Government and that that was your information.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : Yes.

PRESIDENT : And in response to the questions that I put, you admitted that you had no information.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : I said I had no direct information.

PRESIDENT : But you said you have made enquiries at the mofussil Hospitals. How do the mosfussil Medical Officers know whether the Darbar Physician has sent the tour notes to Government or not?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : At least they must know that she visited the Hospitals.

PRESIDENT : That is another matter.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : Without visiting the Hospitals, the Officer in charge cannot make a report to Government.

PRESIDENT : That I can understand.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : If an inspection report is to be prepared by an officer, that officer must have visited the hospital.

PRESIDENT : Then, do you make a definite statement that, from enquiries at the various mofussil hospitals, you have found that the Officer in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties has not visited those particular institutions in which you have made enquiries?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : Yes.

PRESIDENT : Am I right, Mr. K. P. Nilakanta Pillai, in saying that you have committed yourself to a positive statement?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : No. It is not a definite statement. Upon my information, 'if that information is correct', I made that statement... ... ...

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*) : Sir, may I ask the member whether he can give the names of the institutions that I have not visited?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : Yes. Chirayinkil Hospital was one. There was a good deal of complaint there and I hope that the Darbar Physician is well informed of those matters. In the Chirayinkil Hospital, a quarrel is going on between the two doctors.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*) : Sir, the Darbar Physician has visited the Chirayinkil Hospital.

PRESIDENT : Your statement was that the Darbar Physician did not visit the Chirayinkil Hospital but the Darbar Physician says that she visited the Chirayinkil Hospital.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : It may be before the quarrel I mentioned. That depends upon the date on which I made my enquiry.

PRESIDENT : Then, you should have said that the Darbar Physician did not visit the place between such and such a date.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : Yes. That I must ascertain.

PRESIDENT : Then you must not have put the question to the Darbar Physician. You said that she did *not* visit the hospital. That was a positive and sweeping statement.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : When I made my enquiry, I learnt that she did not visit the place.

PRESIDENT : Proceed now, please.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : It is one of the principal duties of the Heads of Departments to submit to Government their tour notes and the failure to submit their inspection report, I must say, is a grave dereliction of their duties.

PRESIDENT : Do you assert that there was a failure to submit the inspection diaries?

MR. K. P NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : If such a thing has actually occurred, that is surely a dereliction of duty.

Then what I must come to is—when no permanent Darbar Physician is appointed, the discipline in the mofussil hospitals is very much wanting. This kind of stop-gap arrangement in the absence of a permanent Darbar Physician has thrown the whole department out of gear in as much as the medical officers are left to themselves.

PRESIDENT : What has this got to do with what you call circuiting work?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : I am not allowed to speak. In that case, I may submit that, if precedents and practices of the right sort established in this Council are so consistently broken, I must sit down without making a speech.

PRESIDENT : If you confine yourself to your motion, I should certainly allow you to proceed.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : By saying so much I thought I could call the attention of Government to the fact that these institutions are not properly supervised.

MR. G. RAMAN MENON (*Mavelikara* cum *Kartikapalli*) : Is that not a matter relating to travelling allowance?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : Yes. Travelling allowance is generally utilised by the officer for going and inspecting the mofussil hospitals. Is that irrelevant, Sir?

PRESIDENT : That is perfectly relevant.

MR. K P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : I must say that the trend of the obstruction is such—

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

PRESIDENT: I beg your pardon. What word did you use? I did not quite hear it.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): That my speech is based on indefinite information. That is the information which comes to us in these cases. We cannot proceed after getting detailed information from the Darbar Physician or Government in these matters because departmental correspondence is very confidential.

MR. C. P. TARAKAN (*Kunnatnad*): Is it not open to the member to put interpellations to Government and thereby get the information?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): I have sent in a lot of interpellations to Government but they have been disallowed.

MR. C. P. TARAKAN (*Kunnatnad*): Then why not write to Government and get the information?

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): But it is said that they are confidential.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): Are the members allowed to talk to one another? I think they must address the Chair.

MR. C. P. TARAKAN (*Kunnatnad*): I was only addressing the Chair.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): I must say only this much, that the supervision that is going on now is not sufficient and that the institutions should be carefully supervised. With these words, I beg to make the motion.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*): Sir, I have been very much interested to hear what Mr. K. P. Nilakanta Pillai had to say about the unsatisfactory circuiting work of the officer in charge. I can quite understand, Sir, that a member of this House has every right to know how public money is being spent and to bring it to the notice of this House if he is aware that the money is being ill-spent. But, I fail to see how any member of this House can make such allegations against the officer in charge of the Medical Department without sufficient facts to support his statements.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): May I know when the Chirayinkil Hospital was visited?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*): I shall give him the date if he will only be patient. I think, after the statements made by Mr. K. P. Nilakanta Pillai, that this House has begun to feel that supervising work in the mofussil hospitals has not been properly done because of the present arrangement. But after I have related my part of the story, I hope the members of this House will be able to arrive at a satisfactory decision in this matter.

I shall remind Mr. Nilakanta Pillai that the first duty of the Darbar Physician as laid down in the Medical Code is to attend on His Highness the Maha Raja and the members of the Royal family. I need not point out—

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : Therefore, does it mean that the Darbar Physician should not inspect mofussil hospitals ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*) : No, it does not mean that. But, that is the first duty expected of the Darbar Physician. At present the professional duties of the Darbar Physician are multiplied. Some of the members of this House will remember the circumstances under which I took charge of the department. That was about the end of September last year. My services were required for the Royal family for about two months after this, during which time I could only attend to office work and could not go much outside the capital. But I felt that this was not satisfactory and in Tulam, 1100, I started my inspection work. In Dhanu and Makaram I was 21 days on circuit, during which time I travelled 770 miles by land and water, and inspected 23 institutions and sites for dispensaries including Kumarakam, Piravam, Kuravalangad and Pambadi—some of these are places that had not been visited by the Darbar Physician for about three to ten years. (Mr. C. P. Tarakan : *Hear, hear.*)

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : May I know where these places are ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*) : I suppose the member knows where Kumarakam is.

MR K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : I do not know. Is it anywhere near Kottayam ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*) : Yes, it is near Kottayam.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : May I know where the Darbar Physician camped ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*) : The Darbar Physician's headquarters was at Kottayam.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : May I know how long the Darbar Physician stayed there ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*) : In Dhanu and Makaram I halted for three days.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*) : The rest of the days ?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*) : The rest of the days was spent in circuit. In Kumbham, Minam and Medam I was again on circuit for 21 days and I travelled 660 miles. During this time, I inspected 18 places including Arnakal, Bonami, Peermade, Tekkadi and Kumili. During this circuit, I had to visit the Royal family at Peermade and at Trivandrum. In Edavam, I was on tour for 16 days during which time I travelled 511 miles by land and water, inspected 14 institutions and sites for dispensaries including Pulinkunnu (which had not been inspected by any Darbar

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mrs. M. Poonen Lukose.]

Physician, though the inhabitants had been petitioning the Government for over ten years for a dispensary. I also visited the Royal family at Peermade and at Trivandrum. It was not for a mere pleasure ride that I came from Kottayam and Peermade to Trivandrum. The total number of days that I spent on circuit was 67, during the last ten months. If the member will refer to the *Almanac and Directory*, he will find that there are 31 State Hospitals. Of these I have *inspected*, not purely visited but inspected, 29. (Mr. C. P. Tarakan: *Hear, hear.*) Shencottah and Parur have been left out. But I hope, after next week, I shall be able to go to Shencottah also. There are 36 State Dispensaries. If we exclude three of these which are connected with the Palaces, there are only 33 Dispensaries which the Darbar Physician is permitted to inspect. Of these, two are bi-weekly Dispensaries in which there is practically no inspection to be done, because they are managed by Medical Officers in charge of two mofussil stations and the records of these dispensaries are maintained by the Medical Officers in their institutions. So that, Sir, out of 31 dispensaries that the Darbar Physician can inspect, I have inspected 25. Of the grant-in-aid dispensaries, 16 in number, I have visited and inspected 8. So that, the total number of institutions I have visited and inspected comes to 62. Besides these, I have had to go to a mofussil hospital to enquire into a complaint against the Medical Officer, and I have inspected 10 sites for dispensaries and two private dispensaries that had applied for grant. Some of these places are very difficult to get at. The inhabitants of some of these places have been praying for the opening of a dispensary for over ten years and no Darbar Physician had inspected them before. I shall now give the House the number of institutions outside the capital visited by the Darbar Physician during the 3 previous years.

In 1097	...	28	institutions inspected.
In 1098	...	36	do. do.
In 1099	...	35	do. visited and inspected.

So much for the quantity of the inspection work done by me. I realise this alone is not enough. There is the quality of the inspection work.

PRESIDENT: Time.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*): I would like to say a few words more. I hope, Sir, you will allow me one or two minutes more, since it is a serious charge that has been made against me.

PRESIDENT. Very well.

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*): The quality of the inspection work has also to be considered.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): May I know whether all these inspection diaries are with the Government?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*): Some of them are.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): How many?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*): I could not now answer that. All the inspection reports could not be sent up, because the camp clerk had fallen ill and had taken leave. Some of the information necessary for the reports is with him. He is expected to return to duty very soon and the inspection reports will be sent in due course. It does not follow from this that the mofussil hospitals have not been inspected by me.

As for the quality of inspection work, I do not think that this House is competent to judge that, except perhaps one member on the other side of the House. I hope I have made myself sufficiently clear. The member mentioned something about Chirayinkil Hospital. I think it was in Kumbham or Minam that I inspected that hospital. The incident that the member referred to is one which took place in Chirayinkil only recently. There was some trouble between the Medical Officer and his Assistant and two deputations came up to Trivandrum to explain matters last week. I have also obtained reports from the Medical Officer in charge a few days back.

It was not possible for me to go to Chirayinkil and enquire into the matter, during the sittings of the Legislative Council and even if I were to go there, I do not think much would be gained, because I have already heard both sides from the members of the two deputations.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): May I know whether it is not possible to transfer one of these Medical Officers?

MRS. M. POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge of the Darbar Physician's duties*): That question does not arise now.

The Darbar Physician, unlike other officers, is not always able to arrange inspection work just as he or she chooses, because other equally important duties have also to be attended to. Government have recognised this and given special concessions to the Darbar Physician in the matter of travelling.

MR. P. K. NARAYANA PILLAI (*Ambalapuzha*): From the accoun given by the Darbar Physician with respect to the matter of circuiting work, creditable work appears to have been done, and I cannot understand on what basis my friend Mr. K. P. Nilakanta Pillai has rested his charge.

PRESIDENT: Mr. Narayana Pillai, as you will have observed, I subjected Mr. Nilakanta Pillai to a rather severe ordeal, because I suspected that he had not quite well grasped the fact that, before a member

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[President.]

makes an attack either direct or insidious upon a responsible officer of Government, he should be sure of his facts. I felt that Mr. Nilakanta Pillai was not sure of his facts and it has transpired that that was so. He himself hardly realises that he was arguing on what the gentleman sitting by his side the other day admitted to be not fact, but hearsay. I had another object in speaking to Mr. Nilakanta Pillai as I did, and that was that I hoped he will, as a new member, very soon realise what practically all the old members here do, that the business of the Council is responsible and serious and not to be conducted on assumptions and hearsay.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): As to the kind of information which I got, I know that the officer in charge also confessed that there was a quarrel between the two doctors in the Chirayinkil Hospital. That matter was brought to my notice a month or so back. I personally met the doctors and asked them whether the Dārbar Physician in charge had been to the place and made enquiries about it. But they said that after the date of their transfer to the place the Darbar Physician had not been to the place, and that no inspection was made. This is the information I got after local enquiry. Am I estopped from using that information in my argument? Of course, it is hearsay information. When the diaries are admitted to be confidential, I cannot be more definite, but I think it is my duty that, after local enquiry about the condition of the hospital in Chirayinkil, I must make use of that enquiry in bringing to the notice of Government that there is some confusion in the hospital and that it can be cured by proper inspection of the institution by the Head of the Department. That is the object with which I wanted to make this motion. The officer will also admit that there is a quarrel; and who is to suffer for it, but the poor patients? It is very easy for two doctors to quarrel with each other (*laughter*). But who are the sufferers? It is the poor patients. They do not get medicine. Is it not the duty of the Darbar Physician when she has got direct information from the doctors that she should run up to the place or make some arrangement for the conduct of the institution which is maintained at the expense of the taxpayer?

PRESIDENT: I do not think you need make a speech about all that.

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): I simply wanted to explain, because I am very much blamed for basing my arguments on hearsay. Am I not entitled to make use of this information in moving this motion?

PRESIDENT: You have made ample excuse for yourself. The whole House realises, as I do, that when you made your statement you were misled and labouring under a misapprehension (*laughter*).

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. K. P. NILAKANTA PILLAI (*Chirayinkil*): This of course is not a misapprehension so far as Chirayinkil Hospital is concerned. Anyhow I am very sorry that I had to criticise the department presided over by a female (*laughter*), by a lady. I thought that it was my duty to do so even though it is very hard to criticise departmental heads about their action and supervision. With these words, I withdraw the motion.

PRESIDENT: Does the House permit the motion to be withdrawn?

The motion was, by leave, withdrawn.

PRESIDENT: The House will now adjourn and meet at half past eleven to-morrow morning.

The Council adjourned at 5-33 P. M.

T. P. RAMASUBBA AIYAR,
Secretary to the Legislative Council.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly